

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459 Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens
Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION

DATE: July 24, 2014

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: David Morton, Acting-Chair

Rodney Barker, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Katy Hax Holmes, Staff Nancy Grissom, Member Bill Roesner, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

See Attendance List

ABSENT: Mark Armstrong, Member

Jean Fulkerson, Member

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Chairman. Voting permanent members were Morton, Barker, Grissom, and Roesner. Alternate member Fitzmaurice voted. Katy Hax Holmes acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded on an H2 device. The second item (64 Evelyn Road) was not heard due to the owner's request to have it heard in August. The seventh agenda item (47 Cook Street) withdrew without prejudice because the house had been sold. There were no owners present for 17 Crehore Drive but this item was heard.

Vote for Officers

Annual election of Chairman and Secretary

Because Rodney Barker had to leave the meeting early, Barker requested that the Chairman hold elections at the beginning of the meeting rather than the end. Dave Morton was elected Chairman of the Commission with a vote of 5 - 0 (Mr. Morton did not vote). Nancy Grissom was elected Secretary by a vote of 6 - 0 (Ms. Grissom voted).

515 Dudley Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Judith Keone, owner of this property, presented her plan to have her home considered for demoltion in order to keep options open for her children. The owner wished to downsize and her duagheter was interested in the house, but was not sure she wanted to keep it.



Staff reported that this Ranch Style house was built in 1950 by Gloria Realty Company (who also built the house at 525 Dudley Road) in a neighborhood of similarly designed Ranch homes. A two-car garage was built at the same time as the house, which was constructed in wood with brick veneer. In 1952 the house was owned by William Katz, who worked in the lumber industry. Katz was also the owner when the porch was enclosed with a screen and "plastic roof." The current owner, Judith Keone, owned the house as of at least 1984. Due to the relatively intact nature of this Ranch Style house and neighborhood, staff recommended this house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-2:

RESOLVED to find the building at 515 Dudley Road **preferably preserved** for neighborhood historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Len Sherman, Alternate

The motion passed.

64 Evelyn Road - Demolition Review (Coming back next month)

Request to demolish house and garage

The owners for Evelyn Road contacted staff prior to the meeting and requested to be heard at the August meeting. This application was not heard at the July hearing.

Ellen Klapper and Bill Roesner arrived after this item.

140 Pond Brook Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Alex Genin of Boston Property Realty Group presented his plan to demolish the house. Mr. Genin told the Commission that more than half of the houses on the street were new, and that the garage addition was illegal. He also said the property was in deteriorated condition, and briefly discussed the retaining walls on the property.

Staff reported that in 1946, Arnold Hartmann obtained a permit to build this single family Cape Style house with a garage (a Commission member believed instead that the house was a Colonial). This house was located in a neighborhood of like post-World War II housing, but with a side orientation that was somewhat unusual for this street. In 1950, the owner was Arthur J. Gorney, a physician, who constructed the concrete block garage visible on the site today. The house appeared to retain its massing and postwar character. Though the house was constructed at the same period as others on the street, it did not appear to be the best example of post-war architecture on the street. Staff therefore recommended the house not preferably preserved.

No abutters were present. Commission members discussed whether the house was Colonial or cape and that ledge on the site had resulted in an awkward house layout and unfortunate garage design and placement.

Grissom made a motion to find the house at 140 Pond Brook Road **not preferably preserved.** Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:



RESOLVED to find the building at 140 Pond Brook Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

> Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair**

Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

88 Crescent Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and garage

Scott Zink, LLC and his attorney Franklin Schwarzer told the Commission that many alternatives were being discussed for this property and that they wanted a preferably -preserved finding. A single-family attached dwelling proposal was under consideration for the property, they said, and that the owner would likely seek a special permit for the project.

Staff reported that this fine Four-Square house with a construction date of 1880 had a hipped roof and front veranda that spanned most of the front façade. The house adjoined the west border of the Myrtle Baptist Church NR District. The 1886 insurance map did not show a Crescent Street listing; but by 1895, the house at this location was owned by Chris, a painter, and Hannah B. Needham. The house was still there in 1907. As an intact example of worker housing in the Myrtle Baptist Church neighborhood, staff recommended the house and garage preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

Elaine Aruda, who said she lived in the neighborhood, said she lived in a historic working class neighborhood and did not want to see this house torn down. She was also opposed to additional attached dwellings on the house. Nancy Holig, Crescent Street, also said she was against demolition of the house. Melissa Wiley, 24 Sharon Avenue, reiterated this sentiment and said she thought this house was lovely and well-sited as compared to houses on Auburn Street. Rick Jacobson, 117 Crescent Street,, said he supported the earlier abutter remarks. Isabel Albeck spoke in support of the abutters as well. Mr. Shuber, 98 Crescent Street, said he did not want to the neighborhood to lose another house.

Sherman made a motion to find the house at 88 Crescent Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 88 Crescent Street preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1816 Commonwealth Avenue - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Earnest Rogers of Rogers & Co. told the Commission the house was small and that the interior was in deteriorated condition. He believed the house could not be rehabilitated. He told the Commission he wanted to tear down this house and build a centerentrance Colonial.

Staff reported that the application for this Modern Traditional house listed 1935 as the construction date, but a building permit application in ISD shows 1948 as the construction date. This house stands on the southwest side of Commonwealth Avenue on land originally owned by William R. Stevenson, a Newton Highlands resident, who is also listed as builder. C. Crowell is listed as the architect. This architect is presumably Christopher Crowell, who designed a few homes on Nevada Street and whose homes on that street have been found not preferably preserved in the past. Arthur G. Diem, and department store executive, appears to be the first owner in 1949 and lived there with his wife until at least 1953. Arthur Pitman appears next as the owner in 1961 but it appears he did not live there. In 1968 the owner was Lewis Pelligrini, contractor, who continued to own the house until at least 1980. This two-story, hipped roof home appears to retain its general massing, post World-War II appearance and detail, and from the exterior has been little altered since its construction. There are no building permits in the file for additions to the house. This house retained its historic context in the neighborhood with other post war houses on Commonwealth Avenue, and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context and architectural integrity.

Elaine Aruda said she lived near Commonwealth Avenue and said this house stood out with its large grove of trees and would like to see them saved. Isabel Albeck worried about the grading on the site. An abutter at 30 Cheswick Road also spoke to his concerns about possible changes in grade with a new structure. Commission members said they liked how the house fit with the context of the neighborhood and that an addition on this house would be preferable.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house at 88 Crescent Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context. Barker seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the building at 1816 Commonwealth Avenue **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Len Sherman, Alternate
Bill Roesner, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

14 Talbot Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and shed

Lawrence Lee, council for the owner, and Ji Shi, the owner were in attendance to propose taking down the house at this address. Mr. Lee added to staff's report by saying that the front and back porches had been enclosed at a later date. Mr. Lee also said that the owner had worked very hard to find alternatives to the demolition of this house and had exhausted all of them. A neighborhood petition and two letters of support were presented which contained signatures from all of the abutters showing their support for taking down the house. A structural engineering report was also presented showing the deteriorated condition of the house.

Staff reported that this house was built as part of a small development on the east side of the road of one-story houses with jerkin head roofing. This house was permitted by ISD in 1927, not 1903 as was presented on the application. Built and owned by Fred H. Watkins of Brighton, permits for this and three other cottages located to the south of this one at 18, 24, and 28 Talbot Street were pulled the same year. Unlike the other cottages located to the south of this house on Talbot, this address did not appear in directories until about 1940, when Lester and Esther Farrell, an industry worker, were listed as the owners. There are also no houses shown on this street in the 1929 insurance map. The Farrells still owned the house in 1959, when Lester became supervisor

at Woodland Dairy in Watertown. By 1975, Lester was a custodian for Newton Public Schools. By 1985 the house was owned by Helen Maher. Though these cottages are by all indications kit houses, this design did not appear in Sears catalog collections. The shotgun floor plan, central jerkin head gable and enclosed front porch are consistent architectural themes throughout. It is for this reason that staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic context.

Commission members discussed the merits of the house as well as the neighbor's support of the owner's proposed plans. This house was not the oldest in the development, nor was it the best maintained example. Commission members acknowledged the support of the neighbors.

Sherman made a motion to find the house at 14 Talbot Street **not preferably preserved.** Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the building at 14 Talbot Street **not preferably preserved** for reasons cited in the discussion.

Rodney Barker, Member

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

47 Cook Street – Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

This item was formally withdrawn without prejudice due to the fact that the property was recently sold and the new owners were planning to restore the house.

33 Green Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and garage

Bruno DiDuca, owner, attended with his brother to present their plans to demolish their father's house. They told the Commission the house had been heavily altered over the years and was in deteriorated condition; and that it was not in harmony with any other house in the neighborhood.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1880 during the same period of building activity as 47 Cook Street. This house, though somewhat obscured by vegetation, was built as worker housing in the Italianate style. Owned by James Claffey in the early 1880s, this house stands on a corner lot with a rear detached garage that was built later. The three-bay, single pile house form was common during this era of construction in Nonantum. James Claffey appears as the first owner on the 1886 insurance map. Rose Claffey, a seamstress, owned the house in the late 1920s and under her ownership built a two-story rear addition on the house in 1927. Mrs. Jane Quigley, a widow who took in boarders, owned the house in 1929 and in 1934 built the garage. She continued to own the property until at least 1951. Frank DiDuca, plasterer, owned the house in 1963 and expanded the garage to hold three cars. He built a rear porch in 1967 and continued to own the house until at least 1980 and built a rear porch the same year. Though the front porch has been bricked in, the windows replaced and a rear ell added, the house retained its historical context a as an early worker cottage in Nonantum. As such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context.

Alison Leary, 192 Chapel Street and Ward 1 Alderman, stated her concern over the number of demolitions in her ward. She acknowledged that this house was not as significant as others in the area but said it was still part of the fabric of the neighborhood. Many abutters spoke to the gardens on this property as worth saving. Greg Forsyth, Chapel Street, came to the meeting to support the application and that he thought the house should come down because it had no historic value Terry Sarrow, Prince Street, said

he did not want to see a two-family house on this lot. Commission members discussed the fact that this house had been heavily altered and decided to separate the vote between the house and the garage.

Barker made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 3-4:

RESOLVED to find the house at 33 Green Street **preferably preserved** for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

The motion did not pass. The house is not preferably preserved and no delay is imposed.

Sherman made a motion to find the garage not preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the garage at 33 Green Street not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

41 Vineyard Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Jay Goldman, owner of the house, said he grew up in the house and after the loss of his parents decided the house should be let go. The house had been in the family 60 years and there was nothing special about it, he said.

Staff reported that a 1921 building permit was found for this Dutch Colonial House in ISD's building permit files. The Assessors database showed a 1930 date, which was not correct. Standing in a neighborhood of houses of similar construction date and massing, this house stands at the corner of Morton and Vineyard and has been little altered. In 1937 the owner was Halvor R. Seward, a cotton goods broker, who in that year obtained a permit to build the garage. The Sewards owned the house through the 1950s until it was purchased by Morris Goldman, a buyer. The Goldmans owned the house until the late 1990s. This house is an intact example of its style and is located on a street where alterations have been minimal. As such staff recommended this house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context.

No abutters were in attendance. Commission members thought the house was a fine example of a Dutch Colonial Style home and that an addition would be preferable to a new house.



Sherman made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the garage at 41 Vineyard Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Negative

Voting in the Affirmative: Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman. Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

61 Esty Farm Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish two-family house

The owner, Marc Spigel, was not present, but the prospective buyer and two abutters came to the meeting.

Staff reported that the building permit for the construction of this split-level house in 1959 is the only permit application in the ISD folder. Sunny Lane Homes, a construction company working in partnership with R.I. Williams, architect, was responsible for the design and construction of all the houses on this street. The Esty Farm Road-June Lane area is considered to be one of the largest collections of Contemporary-style, split-level houses in Newton. In 1961, Abraham Spigel, lawyer, was listed as the owner of the house and it stayed in the family until 2013.

This is how Kathleen Kelly Broomer, architectural historian, described the houses on this street on a proposed area district form in 2003:

"In 1958, architect R. I. Williams introduced a third form of split-level to the area, with over one dozen examples of the form built along Esty Farm Road in 1958 and 1959. Among these "flying wing" splits, as identified by Massey and Maxwell, are 21 Esty Farm Road [1958, photo 4], 22 Esty Farm Road [1958, photo 5], 41 Esty Farm Road [1958, photo 6], 60 Esty Farm Road [1959, photo 7], 61 Esty Farm Road [1959, photo 8], 66 Esty Farm Road [1959, photo 7], 67 Esty Farm Road [1958, photo 8], and 544 Saw Mill Brook Parkway [1958] at the corner of Esty Farm Road. These houses have the entry situated at grade, immediately adjacent to paired garage bays. Projecting slightly over the front wall of the entry and garage level is the bedroom area with two three-part windows consisting of fixed sash at the center and sliding sash at either end. Living room windows dominate the other side of the facade, and in some instances, windows for the finished basement beneath the living room are clearly visible on properties with limited foundation plantings. A major feature of this house form is the asymmetrical, front-gable roof with exposed beams; the peak of the roof is centered above the entry-garage-bedroom stack,

and the long slope sweeps down over the living room-basement stack. Exterior end-wall chimneys are narrow and deep in footprint

Staff reported that the house at 61 Etsy Farm Road was a fine example of this period of architecture and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context as part of a planned community.

The abutters in attendance, Maxine Marcus, 72 Esty Farm and one other, gave a brief history of the area. They said the houses were built on what used to be the Esty Farm and that there was some fill on the lots. They were also concerned



and pierce the overhanging eaves on the living room side of the houses."

about drainage from a new structure on the lot, since flooding was already common. Commission members discussed the fact that this was an intact planned development and that the homes were very well designed and constructed.

Sherman made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and historic context. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

Abstained

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 61 Esty Farm Road **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity and historic context.

Voting in the Negative

Voting in the Affirmative: Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

88 Adena Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and garage

Attorneys for the owner (Jim Casey) and the prospective buyer, who is Dennis Razis, presented their agreed-upon plan to demolish what had become a derelict shell of a house. Work that commenced on the house over a year ago was stopped for legal reasons and the house had since been exposed to the weather.

Staff reported that the house was built in 1949. This Cape Style house was owned by H.C. McDonald, whose residence was at 91 Warwick Road in Newton; designed by S. Swaczyk of Medford, MA; and built by K. Karahaskian of 16 Russell Road in Newton. A permit for interior demolition only was issued in March 2013, but since then the windows and exterior cladding were also removed. This work was stopped and is being handled by the Inspectional Services Department. In 1952 the owner was John Cain, a meat cutter. In 1955 the owner was William Wolfson, production manager at Consolidated Bag and Foil. In 1975, Peter McHugh, an insurance broker, and family owned the house and continue to do so. Though the NHC was not given the opportunity to see this house before work began, online photos of the house and a review of the neighborhood context for the house suggest that the NHC would have believed the house was in context with the neighborhood. Therefore staff recommended the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Three abutters in attendance supported its demolition: Michael Crystal (Adena Road), Jonathan Claybris (Llewellyn Road), and Yoren Bornstein (93 Adena). Ward Aldermen Ted Hess-Mahan and Jim Cote from Ward 3 also spoke in support of its demolition. A petition was also presented showing the names of other neighbors who supported letting the house go. Commission members did not endorse the way in which the house ended up in this condition but felt obligated in this case to serve the needs of the neighborhood.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 88 Adena Road **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative

Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member



Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman. Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

110 Farwell Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Stephen Zhu reported that his family just purchased this house and that it was too small. He said that the project did not involve a complete demo; rather, the plan was to add to the top and back but stay with the original foundation, and that he would attempt to design a house that remained in context.

Staff reported that this 1962 Ranch Style house was built in a neighborhood of like style houses. Duffy Brothers Construction was responsible for building the house. In 1977 the owner was Wey Lew, a mechanic at United Carr Fastener, who continued to own the house until at least 2000. Though this ranch was technically consistent with the ranch development of this neighborhood, there was evidence to suggest that the neighborhood was in an architectural transition. Staff was hard pressed to conclude that the loss of this house would result in a loss of context for the street; therefore, staff recommended the house be found not preferably preserved.

Commission members agreed with staff that this house did not appear to meet the criteria for historic context.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Klapper seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

Voting in the Negative

RESOLVED to find the house at 110 Farwell not preferably preserved.

Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate

Voting in the Affirmative:

Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1580 Beacon Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Vadim Kagan, who said he just purchased the home, told the Commission he wanted to tear the house down and build something nice for the neighborhood.

Staff reported that this stately Colonial Style house was built in 1922 and designed by H.L. Moulton, Moulton Realty Trust of 22 Whitlowe Road in West Newton. Standing two stories with an unusual central eyebrow dormer and single-story wings, this house was first occupied and owned by Frank.A. Wetherell, president of Wetherell Brothers in Cambridge. By 1944, the owners were John and Ruby Fitzgerald, an expeditor with Raytheon. . By 1968 the owner was Robert S. Jones, an engineer. By 1979 a new dormer was added to the hipped roof, presumably at the rear. Given the house was minimally altered and retained its historic neighborhood context of other c.1920s houses, staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity and neighborhood context.

There were no abutters in attendance. Commission members discussed the historic merits of the house and thought it to be worth preserving for architectural integrity.



Abstained

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved for architectural integrity. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 1580 Beacon Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative

Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

125 Pine Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house and shed

Dan McAuliffe, owner of this property, told the Commission he wanted to know the house down and build a better house on the site. He told the Commission he built the Ivory Drive subdivision behind this property. Mr. McAuliffe stated that he did not think this was a historic house of any merit, and that the whole house was built on peat.

Staff reported that this Astylistic house had a date of construction listed as 1900, but there was evidence to suggest this house was built as early as c.1850. The house is first identified on insurance maps in 1875, with the name Neagle shown as the owner; but Martin Neagle, a laborer, appears in the 1868 directory with a house on Pine in West Newton. An 1856 map shows house dots at this location. Mary Neagle, owner, and a boarder, David Neagle, a blacksmith, appear in 1895 and also on the 1907 insurance map. By 1911, the owner was Joseph Meilman, whose occupation was listed as "junk." Mr. Meilman obtained a permit in 1911 to construct a wood frame shed for wagons. In 1927, Meilman added a sun porch to the house, and still owned the house into the 1940s. By 1953 the owner was Joseph S. Venuto, who stored abandoned vehicles on the property. In 1962, Mr. Venuto received a building permit to raise the existing roof to provide more headroom in the upstairs bedrooms. The Venuto family continued to own the property until recently. Due to the previously undocumented age of this structure and evidence that this could be a c.1850 structure, staff recommended the house preferably preserved for architectural integrity.

Nancy Farm of Colgate Road said she did not like to see so many demolitions and that she drives by this house every day. Commission members discussed the history of the house as being c.1850 but were hard pressed to see anything on the house that was worth preserving. One Commission member said she thought this might have been a home-made house from the beginning and thus not very structurally sound.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-2:

RESOLVED to find the house at 125 Pine Street **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Voting in the Negative Rodney Barker, Member Abstained

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Len Sherman. Alternate



54 Carleton Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Joe Flaherty, owner of this house, said he wanted to tear it down because all of the historic detail was lost and was in terrible condition, but would stand by what the NHC decided. Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road said she thought it was a great house.

Staff reported that this end-gable Victorian house has an assessor's date of 1890, but a survey form for this property on file with the Massachusetts Historical Commission shows a possible construction date of c.1860. Little architectural detail remains, but the architectural detail of the porch suggests an Italianate influence on the original house. Henry M. Stimson, editor and publisher of the *Newton Journal*, owned this house c.1870 and lived there until at least 1900. The *Journal* was founded in 1866 and was published in Newton Corner. By 1929 Elizabeth Regan, a seamstress, owned the house and had a boarder. In 1953, Donald MacGregor, carpenter, was listed as the owner and he and family lived there well into the 1960s. In 1976 the owner was Vincent Bastianelli, a sales rep. No permits for structural work on this house are on file with the city. Though windows have been replaced and architectural detailing lost, the house retained its original massing and historic context in the Newton Corner neighborhood and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved.

Commission members spoke of the intact history of this street and the fact that this house retained its context. Members also said they thought the house and its detailing could be restored.

Abstained

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 54 Carleton Street preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative:

Rodney Barker, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member

Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Len Sherman, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1657 Center Street - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner of this house, Vadim Kagan, told the Commission he wanted to tear down this house and build two townhouses. He said the house was not maintained and needed to be cleaned up.

Staff reported that according to the Assessors database, this house was constructed in 1924, but permits found in the ISD file suggest an earlier date of construction. This Colonial Revival Style house stands in a group with two other similar houses near the busy intersection of Center Street and the Route 9 ramp. In 1910 and 1912, plumbing permits were pulled by Vincent M. Turley for a two-family house at this address. Mr. Turley pulled another permit in 1927 for a new garage at the rear of the lot and a new single room rear addition. In 1936, Humphrey Anderson and Julia Mills resided at this address. In 1945 Harold Dooley, a bookkeeper, was a resident there. In 1959 the owner is listed as Henry Brunette. Tom Connelly is listed as the owner from at least 1977. This house has been altered over time, with faux siding, replacement windows, and loss of original architectural fabric. The house, however, retained its overall massing and was in keeping with the two other buildings on the north side of Center Street on this block. Staff therefore recommended the house preferably preserved for historic neighborhood context.

Commission members discussed whether the house retained any historical merit or if too much had been lost with insensitive additions. Members cited the fact that the house was surrounded by commercial development and parking lots.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>July 24, 2014</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0-1, with Barker abstaining:

RESOLVED to find the house at 1657 Center Street **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

1615 Beacon Street, NR – Demolition Review Request to demolish house

Sheldon Peck, owner of this house, spoke about his plans to sell the house and his wish to have the option to allow it to be torn down. He told the Commission he bought the house in 1984 and had demolished some sheds and barns on the property to make room for new additions and a dentist office over time. Mr. Peck said that his was the 14th family to live in the house, but that he was retired and wanted to move soon. He told the Commission he had no residential abutters and that a new owner would likely want neighbors.

Staff reported that the house was listed on the National Register of Historic Places as part of a historic district in the late 1980s, and the Staples – Crafts – Wiswall House was built in the middle of the eighteenth century. Though added onto for years, what is thought to be the original Georgian floor plan has been updated with Federal and later styles that contribute to the historic significance of the house over time. The current house was built on what was thought to be the site of the Deacon John Staples house. Moses Craft, who was raised by the Staples household, is believed to have constructed the house now standing. An ell that he added in 1769 was given to his son. William Wiswall, a cousin of Moses Craft, was the subsequent owner and the one believed responsible for adding Federal Style details to the house. David Kinmouth, a dry goods merchant, bought the house c.1860 and gave the house the unusual trim details seen today. As an NR-listed house that contains evidence of some of the earliest residents in Newton, staff recommends that house preferably preserved and a demolition delay imposed for eighteen months due to architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context as part of a district.

Many abutters and two aldermen attended the meeting to state their opposition to the proposed demolition plan. Ward Alderman Blazar said he knew the history of the house well because his wife grew up there, and they were married in the back yard. He said his wife's family sold the house to the Pecks with the understanding that the history of the house would be preserved. Mr. Blazar said he could not understand the prospect of "keeping one's options open" when it came to this house. Alderman Danberg said she thought this was one of the finest architectural examples of evolving architectural styles over time and that it retained its architectural integrity. She said that such an important building to be torn down was out of character with Peck and his family and asked what the real thinking was behind requesting permission to demolish the property. Peck responded that he felt that single family ownership of this house was no longer viable and with no residential neighborhood, buyers might find it too isolating. Mr. Peck asked for a thoughtful deliberation and assured the Commission he was not a developer. Alderman Danberg disagreed and gave an example of single family ownership of another historic house. Alderman Danberg asked Mr. Peck to formally withdraw this petition so that the prospect of landmarking this structure could be taken off the table. Mr. Peck did not withdraw his application.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved and an 18-month demo delay imposed on the property. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 1615 Beacon Street **preferably preserved** and an 18-month demo delay imposed on the property.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Rodney Barker left the meeting at 8:45 pm.

258 Cherry Street - Demolition Review

Request for partial demo

Owner Nick Nickalazzo and his architect Scott Lewis presented plans to add a rear addition to the house. The owners have lived there 21 years and wanted to add space for an aging relative.

Staff reported that this Mansard roofed cottage with dormers and window hoods was constructed c.1873. The agenda lists this project as a full demo proposal, but this application actually came in as a partial demo delay. This house was proposed as a full demo in April 2011 and was found preferably preserved at the May 26, 2011 meeting.

The portion of the house to be removed is the rear, where a one-story addition is proposed. The roof and massing of the original house will purportedly remain the same. This cottage-sized interpretation of the Second Empire Style is rare in Newton, as is one that is as well preserved. The bracketed front entrance and window hoods appear to be original design elements. Atlases and city directories show that Phineas Allen, a teacher at Nathaniel Allen's English and Classical School on Webster Street (now a Local Landmark), may have been the first owner of this cottage. Directories show him living there no earlier than 1875, and he lived there for at least ten years. By 1895 the owner was John J. Gannon, mason. By 1915 the owner was Richard E. Meyers, a forester, who continued to live there until at least 1945. By the 1960s, the owners were Paul and June Oulette. Nick and Lydia Nicolazzo are the current owners.

Roesner made a motion to find the house preferably preserved and an 18-month demo delay imposed on the property. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 7-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 258 Cherry Street **preferably preserved** for architectural integrity.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Rodney Barker, Member
Dave Morton, Acting Chair
Nancy Grissom, Member
Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate
Len Sherman, Alternate
Bill Roesner, Member
Ellen Klapper, Alternate

The following paragraph is quoted from the May 26, 2011 NHC meeting minutes when this property was found preferably preserved the first time:



"Property owners Nick and Lydia Nicolazzo presented an application to demolish the residence at this property. The Commission reviewed the application, historical information, and photographs. Staff stated that this circa 1870 Second Empire cottage was owned by Phineas Allen a teacher at Nathaniel Allen's English and Classical School in West Newton. Nathaniel Allen's house at 35 Webster Street is a Newton City landmark. This building has had some alterations including new windows, and an asphalt shingle roof; however its form, ornate trim, and other features are intact. The Nicolazzo's stated that they needed to build an addition that was accessible for a relative and that they did not feel that it was cost effective to build onto the existing home and were considering demolition and constructing a new residence. Lang inquired if the garage was also proposed to be demolished and Nick Nicolazzo stated he was not sure if it would remain. Nicolazzo further stated that a present sewer line on the property presented difficulties in adding an addition. Commission members expressed support for the preservation of the building and suggested that an addition might be cheaper than constructing a new home. Grissom stated that this was a unique house in the neighborhood and had an important historical connection to the Allen School.

Commission members discussed the pros and cons of the new addition proposal. Many wanted to see a mansard roof addition where a flat-roofed addition was proposed, some equating it in appearance to a railroad car. Others thought the addition was too big and appeared alien to the house. Others stated their belief that the addition would be visible from a public way despite the architect's statements otherwise. Commission members offered suggestions as to how the addition could be made more historically palatable: smaller in size, mansard roof to match existing, elevator at the rear for use by the relative. The rooftop and footprint would be believed to be the two areas that could be improved upon. No waiver to the demolition delay was granted.

17 Crehore Drive - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

No owner for this property was present.

Staff reported that in 1950, the owner/builder for this house was Joseph M. Arduino, who built a one-family house with a one car garage. Its first owner occupant was Murray Sherman, a sales rep, who lived in the house and whose family owned the house until it was sold out of the family in 2013. This Ranch Style house is a well maintained example in a neighborhood of like homes of post-World War II construction and as such staff recommended preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Three abutters were in attendance: Bill Ranke (142 Cornell), Debby Roomer (15 Crehore Road) and an abutter at 56 Colgate in Lower Falls. All spoke to the historic character of the street and that its character should be retained. Commission members discussed the fact that the historic character of the neighborhood appeared to be intact.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved for historic context. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 17 Crehore Drive preferably preserved for historic context.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

79 Westgate Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

John Corsi, owner of this property, thinks that the neighborhood is in transition which is why he wants to demolish this split-level house. He did not think there were very many of these left and it did not merit preservation.



Staff reported that the building permit for this house is dated 1953 and was pulled by Home Builders Incorporated, and Lester Lechter, architect. The first owner of record was James Smith, salesman, with no other permits pulled for structural work. In 1970 Harold Bayne owned the house with his wife, who continues to own the house. The split-level house is a well-maintained example in a neighborhood of other split-level homes and as such staff recommended the house preferably preserved for neighborhood context.

Commission members agreed that the neighborhood context in this neighborhood had been lost.

Sherman made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to find the house at 79 Westgate Road **not preferably preserved**.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

Len Sherman, Alternate

115 Windsor Road, NR - Demolition Review Request to demolish house

Helen and Jacob Goldberg, owners, presented their plan to give a prospective new buyer the option of tearing down this house to build a new one. They lived in this house since the 1970s, and after a full interior rehab of the house after it was destroyed by fire, they feel like buyers want a new house with better amenities.

Staff reported that the house was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1990 as part of the Windsor Road Historic District. This house was built in 1908 in a style identified as "eclectic" in the survey form for this property. In a district made notable by its collection of intact Queen Anne, Shingle, Colonial Revival, Craftsman and Tudor Revival Style houses built from the 1880s to the 1940s, this house is considered a contributing architectural resource. The house was owned by D.O. Earle in 1915, and he applied for a garage permit that same year. He was apparently not living in the house at the time, as Harriet Pinglee was listed as the tenant. Charles L. Favinger actually built the garage, by obtaining his own permit when he owned the house in 1920. Mrs. A.P. Favinger lived there as a widow beginning in 1929 and owned the house in the early 1940s, but sold it to James G. Baker by 1943, the same year he obtained a permit for a chicken coop. Alice Favinger appears in the house again in the 1950s. By 1972 the house was owned by Mr. Morris, when it was damaged in a fire. In 1975 the owner was listed as Jacob Goldberg, who in that year applied for a permit to repair and rebuild the home.

Due to its listing on the National Register of Historic Places, staff recommended the house be found preferably preserved and a demolition delay imposed for eighteen months due to architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context as part of a district.

Isabel Albeck, an abutter on Windsor Road, had no comment. No other abutters were present. Commission members discussed the fact that from the exterior the house appeared to be in good condition and that they would err on the side of preserving the house due to its listing on the National Register.

Fitzmaurice made a motion to find the house preferably preserved with an 18-month demo delay imposed. Roesner seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 115 Windsor Road preferably preserved and an 18-month delay imposed due to its listing on the National Register.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

63 Herrick Road, NR - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

Pat Graveland, prospective buyer, presented her plan to demolish the house due to the fact that the house had lost its historic character. The owner signed the application but was not present at the hearing. She said her business was to purchase houses, restore them, and then sell them again, but in this case she said there was no historic detail to preserve. Mitch Bernstein, a realtor in Newton, was also in attendance.

Staff reported that this house was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1986 as part of a historic district in Newton Center. Herrick Road was formerly named Institution Avenue and was part of the Andover Theological Seminary property. Parcels were sold off in the mid-1800s as house lots, resulting in this end-gable Greek Revival house build c.1860. Though the survey form for this property acknowledges alterations to the historic fabric in the 1980s, it was nonetheless included in the NR district and has been deemed a contributing element. As such, staff recommended the house preferably preserved and a demolition delay imposed for eighteen months due to architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context as part of a district.

Commission members pointed out the various exterior elements that were considered to be hallmarks of the Italianate style and that it was its belief those details could be restored. Alderman Danberg reiterated this sentiment. This house contributes to a National Register listed district.

Sherman made a motion to find the house preferably preserved and an 18-month delay imposed. Grissom seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 6-0:

RESOLVED to find the house at 63 Herrick Road preferably preserved and an 18-month delay imposed due to its listing on the National Register.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative **Abstained**

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice. Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate

115 Park Street, NR - Waiver Request

Request to waive demo delay on rear west façade, new foundation

Scott Lewis, designer, and Steve Gagnon, owner, presented their plan to remove the rear façade of the house in preparation for an addition, and remove and re-pour a foundation for the main house.



At the June meeting, Scott Lewis, designer, and Steve Gagnon, owner, presented their plan to remove the rear façade of the house in preparation for an addition, and remove and re-pour a foundation for the main house. As an NR-listed property the house was determined preferably preserved at the June 2014 hearing for architectural integrity and historic neighborhood context, but proposed plans were not approved at the June 2014 hearing due to a mismatch of roof styles on the proposed new addition, and a request for more clarity on the re-poured foundation. Because this project was a partial demolition, they are allowed to return with revised plans.

At the June 2014 hearing, Staff reported that the property was listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1982 as part of the Farlow and Kenrick Parks Historic District, and that this house was erected c. 1870 and stands across the street from the Bigelow School. The unique bell cast Mansard roof is intact, with an unusual projecting front wing creating a T plan. The aluminum siding was to be removed as part of this project, which included a two and a half story addition off the rear of the building. This house was occupied from 1868 to 1905 by S.W. Holmes, a merchant in Boston, and subsequently owned by Lydia H. Holmes. Because the owner was presenting plans for a partial demolition (e.g. a rear addition), the proposed plans were reviewed. This house was one of many Mansard homes lining Park Street.

At this hearing, Commission members and two abutters, Jay Walter in Newton Corner and a resident of 107 Park Street, worked with the architect and developer to understand what the owner was proposing to construct on this property. The architect returned to this hearing with a revised mansard design for the rear addition that met with general approval. All in attendance believed this revised design to be an improvement.

After much discussion the Commission asked to see: a grading plan for the site showing the existing and proposed topography for the lot; replication and replacement of architectural detail, including window trim, brackets, keystones, etc. restored to the areas of the building where existing shadowing shows their former locations; very specific detail on the proposed foundation height, location, material and surfacing; and detail on the plans showing the type of siding to be used on both the house and the addition. A waiver of the demo delay was not issued.

44 Indian Ridge Road - Demolition Review

Request to demolish house

The owner of this house, Fernando Alves, presented his plan to demolish the house. He told the Commission the house was nice enough, but not worth saving.

Staff reported that an application for a roof removal project was first submitted this spring, and in May 2014 staff and the Chair signed off as an appropriate alteration for this particular house and neighborhood. The dormered Cape Style house was deemed to meet the initial criteria for historical significance due to neighborhood context, so staff was consulted for review when plans were submitted for new construction. The proposed plans showed a complete demolition of the house and as such the house was placed on this month's hearing agenda. William P. Kaufman was the first owner of the house in 1946, and the next year he obtained a permit to add a side addition. The architect for this house was M. Guerriere of Newton. Hershey Bernstein, an accountant, owned the house by 1955 when he added a rear addition. Howard Cramer owned the house in 1966. The house is vinyl sided and its windows have been replaced, but it retains its integrity of neighborhood context. Staff recommended the house preferably preserved for context.

Isabel Albeck of Windsor Road thought the house should be preserved. Commission member discussed the house and its relative merits and concluded that it was not a historically significant example of the Cape Style.

Grissom made a motion to find the house not preferably preserved. Fitzmaurice seconded the motion.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:



RESOLVED to find the house at 44 Indian Ridge Road not preferably preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative Abstained

Dave Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate

Bill Roesner, Member

Ellen Klapper, Alternate

360 Langley Road – Waiver Request Request to waive demo delay

The co-owner of this property, Fernando Alves, returned to the Commission with proposed plans in order to waive the delay on its demolition.

Staff reported that this house was determined preferably preserved in March 2014. Four months elapsed, and the owner was returning with a proposed plan for new construction. At the March hearing, Fernando and Daniel Fonseca, owners of this house, told the Commission of their plan to demolish their house due to its small lot size and deteriorated condition. They wanted to build a new structure with an attached garage. Abutters in attendance from 12 Beecher Lane were curious as to what the new house would look like. Abutters from 366 Langley Road were also in attendance on behalf of their 90 year-old neighbor, who was concerned about dust and truck traffic. Commission members discussed their belief that though the house was in fair condition, it was representative of a historical context on Langley Road.

At the March 2014 meeting, staff reported that the house was built c. 1915. Insurance maps showed that a house stood at this location in the 1880s, but this house appeared to have been constructed later. A plumbing permit was pulled in 1918 by the Burke family, who also owned the 1880s structure at this location when it was known as Station Street. By 1929 the property was owned by Umberto and Mary Cassiani, laborer, and later as a landscape gardener. In 1939 a permit was pulled for removing and replacing a rear porch. In 1955, a permit was pulled for a rear room and bath. This house is in deteriorated condition but retains its massing and context with two neighboring houses on Langley Road.

Commission members were concerned about the orientation of the proposed house, the lack of a side entrance, the snout-like projection of the garage on the side street, and the fact that all four elevations were not presented to the Commission. The Commission also asked that grade changes be shown; that the plans needed more detail; that the new house should front on Langley and that all four elevations needed to be reviewed by the Commission.

Administrative Items:

Minutes from the June meeting were approved by those in attendance at that meeting. The meeting was unanimously adjourned at 11:10 pm.

Docket Item for ZAP hearing on August 7th, 2014

At the end of the July 2014 hearing, the NHC took a vote on the second docket item proposed for review by the Zoning and Planning Committee:

#266-14 ALD. BLAZAR, YATES AND DANBERG requesting to amend Section 22-50 to require that in the event there is a transfer of legal or beneficial ownership of a preferably preserved property during the demolition delay period, the full demolition delay period will restart from the date of the transfer of ownership; and further requesting to amend Section 22-50 to require that in the event a transfer of legal or beneficial ownership of a preferably preserved property occurs after the expiration of a

demolition delay period but prior to the issuance of a demolition permit, no demolition permit shall issue until the new owner complies with the procedures of Section 22-50(c)(5).

Morton held a formal vote, during this public hearing, to legitimize the emails of support for the above referenced docket item received by David Morton, Chair, from all but one of the sitting members of the Newton Historical Commission.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on July 24, 2014 the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 5-1:

RESOLVED to support the docket language as written by Ald. Blazar, Yates, and Danberg in #266-14.

Voting in the Affirmative: Voting in the Negative **Abstained** Nancy Grissom, Member **Dave Morton, Acting Chair** Laura Fitzmaurice, Alternate Len Sherman, Alternate Bill Roesner, Member Ellen Klapper, Alternate **Katy Hax Holmes**

Commission Staff